



<b>Title V Spring 2024 Advisory Committee Meeting Minutes</b>		<b>Date:</b>	<b>April 12, 2024</b>		
		<b>Meeting Place:</b>	Zoom		
<b>Called to order:</b>	10:00 a.m.	<b>Chair(s):</b>	Yvonne Teniente/ Mary Patrick	<b>Minutes:</b>	Eloise Bunnell

<b>Members Present:</b>	Erica Biely, Eloise Bunnell, Ana Gomez De Torres, Maria Grando, Elaine Healy, Julia Raybould-Rodgers, Feride Shroeder, Maribel Vargas, Liz West
<b>Members Absent:</b>	Ben Britten, Gabriel Marquez, Mary Patrick, Yvonne Teniente
<b>Guests Absent:</b>	Emilia Borce, Calista Freeland, Cristal Gomez, Athena Maldonado, Abby Plott, Connor Villanueva, Dylan West, Makaela Zavala

	<p style="text-align: center;"><b>Welcome &amp; Introductions</b></p> <p>Maria Grando opened the meeting and thanked everyone for joining the last Title V Advisory Committee meeting for Spring, 2024 Semester.</p>
--	--

<b>Agenda No. 1</b>	<b>Discussion Questions Review</b>
---------------------	------------------------------------

<b>Discussion:</b>	<p>The first meeting was really to establish: What is Title V? What is embedded tutoring? What's going on? What are our goals? And then the second meeting was in-depth as we dug a little deeper into embedded tutoring components, which are also being discussed at a more advanced scale in the Embedded Tutoring Task Force. The purpose of this advisory committee and the most beneficial things we could obtain are recommendations from the group, especially those that are not as deeply entrenched in Title V, like the Leads, myself, and the project directors; we especially value those folks that are not as closely involved with Title V as we are and thank you for being here with us. My hope is that we will be able to finalize recommendations and then talk about the next steps and find out if there are any last-minute items that we want to cover for this semester, and close out. (Maria Grando)</p> <p><b>Discussion Questions Review</b> – There are four items to discuss - click the <a href="#">Discussion Questions Review</a> link to review the document recommendations. Below are areas that were discussed from the list.</p>
--------------------	---

<b>Agenda No. 2</b>	<b>Committee Recommendations</b>
---------------------	----------------------------------

	<p><b>Item 1: Peer Mentoring/Tutoring for English, math, and Science or open to other courses? If open to other courses, please elaborate further.</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Student input is needed.</li> <li>• Focus Groups are planned for Fall 2024</li> <li>• Consider average number for enrollments per course.</li> <li>• Have a campus-wide initiative to embed tutoring <i>component</i> into courses.</li> <li>• Cuesta College has a model for student tutors + added time to courses.</li> </ul>
--	--

<b>Discussion:</b>	<p><u>Erica Biely</u> - The way that we previously selected courses for Title V is to look for any courses that have low success rates and disproportionate impact for Hispanic students. And we focused initially on math, English and science, because those were the ones that were identified first. We also had limited funding, so we had to have a mechanism because we can't support all the classes. Since somebody had asked about what other courses, we could potentially embed tutors, so I went ahead and looked at all of the data. This is just a quick summary of the courses that</p>
--------------------	---



have low success rates and disproportionate impact for Hispanic students. I made the comment that we could think about several strategies for embedded tutoring. One of them is to have a goal of embedding tutors in all math and English classes. Only because it is part of our student center funding formula. That is how we get paid at the college and it is also part of our AB 705 initiative, and part of our Promise requirement, as students must complete math and English to get the second Promise now. There could be some benefit to focusing on those two subjects, as one strategy.

**A second strategy** could be that we ensure the Science, Technology, Engineering and Math (STEM) gateway courses have embedded tutors, and we already have funding through that with our STEM Math, English, Science and Arts (MESA) center. There is a lot of tutoring provided but ensuring that we have those gateway courses across the board and the STEM pathways we support a cause. You can see from the list that a lot of the classes are heavily science related, biology, chemistry, and physics. So that could be another strategy.

**Then lastly**, we could see a pattern that we have a disproportionate impact in some of our larger general education (GE) courses. Things like film 100 or philosophy, or sociology or speech, and it could be that we decide that we want to embed tutors in some of our large GE courses that have success rates and impact our Hispanic population. Those are just three different ideas. We don't have unlimited funding. We would want to know moving forward, and we would either have to be very strategic and figuring out exactly what courses would benefit the most out of the 97 subjects that the Tutorial center supports, and then focus specifically on embedded services for the really critical courses.

Julia Raybould-Rodgers – I was just wondering if we could pair some of these courses together, like I can see being an English person like English 101 and speech 101. We could use the same peer mentor in both courses and have it as a learning community, and that would be an effective way of using the peer mentor.

Erica Biely - That is another fact. We can just add that as one of the other options. The only thing I would say that I know from learning communities is that they are resource intensive, and I don't know the cost benefit analysis having to pay two faculty to coordinate the same peer mentor for two faculty. I just know from talking with people who do the learning communities that it is expensive and time intensive. So that would have to be another conversation. It might end up being less, because we already have a framework in place, but I don't know if we could. Thank you for adding that because it could be another potential.

Julia Raybould-Rodgers - And there is literature out there showing that students who take English and speech in the first year do much better than students who don't. And I think there's a couple more pairings-I've been to some presentations where they worked a lot on this, so there is data out there, but I don't know how much speech and English, for example, need to be linked to the learning community in hours. But I just thought I'd put that out there.

Erica Biely – Great recommendation, and you are right – there are some really good pairings and if we thought about this from an area of interest in each discipline, all students have to take English so what are those other matches, maybe by area of interest at our college that might do so. The health sciences in STEM and creative arts, maybe it's a pairing with each of our areas of interest. That could be a fourth alternative.

Julia Raybould-Rodgers – And it might also help with retention. Retention is the main issue- maybe if we could build a community.



Erica Biely – Which is what we are trying to do with the first-year experience, facilitate those learning communities and areas of interest, and try to have guided pathways; we’re trying to create that infrastructure.

Liz West – One of the things I find interesting, and I was going to suggest is “I’d like to see more student perception in this area.” Speaking from the math lens, I noticed that Math 182 is not on the list and students call it a hard class. I wonder if students take Engineering 100 because they know it is easier.” It seems student perceptions about a class are different than it really is.

Erica Biely – We started to look at classes that students weren’t doing well in, and then they were doing good. Well, they’re doing good because they have embedded services. That’s like the caveat. Maybe that is what made those classes now not disproportionately impacted. And that’s what we want to support. In general, the class used to be disproportionately impacted, and it’s not now, but it has a low success rate every other term depending on who is teaching the class. Math 182 is consistently, disproportionately impacted.

Elaine Healy - We should examine ways to maximize the current tutoring centers on campus because if funding were no issue, then embedded tutoring is a great model. For example: In the Academic Resource Center (ARC) we can provide services at a lower cost, because tutors are working by appointment when the help is needed. In some ways that helps us kind of maximize our dollars. But what needs to happen is work together with embedded tutoring as a campus wide initiative. Like the tutoring ambassador program, where we embed a tutoring component in every class. Every faculty buys into bringing their class to the ARC or talking about it. That’s obviously not the solution for everything, because intrusive tutoring makes a difference, being in their face and reminding them. But even though we know that if students come to tutoring, they’re 21% more successful in their classes, and we know from the writing center if they come to the ARC for 3 hours a semester, they are more likely to pass English 101-it makes a difference. So, we know just meeting with a tutor whether it’s your embedded tutoring class or coming to the ARC and having that one-on-one time makes a difference. It’s just getting everybody to buy into it and encourage their students to come. Think of it as a multi-pronged approach.

Feride Shroeder – Mentioned that Cuesta College has a model for their introductory chemistry class, called facilitator assisted learning. They are talking about embedding tutors’ kind of permanently as a component, where they have courses that have an extra hour tagged onto them and are led by student tutors.

**Item 2: Cohesion between on-campus and high school peer mentoring/tutoring efforts.**

- This feels like something that involves concurrent enrollment and maybe we should ask those people.
  - For Fall 2024 – English 101 will be concurrent in high schools (pilot).
- High school tutors could be invited to the AHC tutor trainings or AHC tutors can mentor high school tutors.
  - Explore this partnership further, branding tutoring as a vitamin and not a medication.

**Discussion:**

Erica Biely - I thought it was mentioned at one of our meetings that the high schools were having discussions of moving to a model like Hancock’s peer mentoring model in the high schools. We are curious, what those peer mentors would be called, and how you were utilizing them. Because it would be good to know what’s happening at the high schools in terms of this model. What elements of that we could carry over here as part of what we’re doing in the other task force. For example: What do we call these things? What do we name them? Peer mentors, tutors, embedded tutors, facilitators, so it would be beneficial to know or be talking with the high schools about



what they're calling their program. It would be nice for students to be familiar with the model before they come to Hancock. We are interested in knowing what the high schools plan on doing and partnering with them. If there are peer mentors at the high schools now that would be a plus for when they get to Hancock. I'd be interested in learning more about that.

Maribel Vargas-Meza – Yes, that has been mentioned since we found out what Hancock is doing. It was something that we're kind of exploring and looking into and because these could be either credit or paid, we are looking at a job description for these positions. But currently on this item our tutoring efforts here at the high school level, have a couple of options: 1) in-person tutoring and 2) online tutoring. For online, we offer tutoring.com, 24 hours a day, 7 days a week for all our students. They get a live tutor through the website, and then our in-person tutoring is done by our certificated teachers. It's a little different at each high school. I think there was a comment about having some of our tutor's help, but our teachers are the ones actually doing our tutoring, and some of our instructional assistants do our tutoring for our newcomer students. But we are not in the peer mentoring cycle yet. It's just in the discussion phase to implement some of that, and hopefully with Hancock doing that already, we would be able to collaborate with Hancock.

Erica Biely - That would be great. Also, I mentioned before but I have to give Elaine credit for this, that we've been really on the saying that "tutoring is like a vitamin and not medication." This is something that's a healthy behavior that all students should be doing. This practice is for all students, not just for people that need extra help-it's good strategies for all students. It's something students should be doing from day one, we are trying to change the mindset. We'd be happy if there are any meetings at the high school district and want to invite us, please definitely call us. We would be interested in attending.

Maribel Vargas-Meza - Perfect. Thank you. I was thinking about that so if we can have your team do a brief presentation it would be beneficial to our curriculum and instruction group as well. So, we would be interested.

Liz West – Do you know if the district is tracking the data? And if so, what are they tracking (i.e., who's using the services, how much are the services being used, etc.). I'd be curious to find out a little more about the data around it as we talk about the student perception.

Maribel Vargas-Meza – We are looking at data now, as we're developing our Lcap ground we are looking at programs. We have usage but no actual numbers. We are planning to move forward with tutor.com as well as in-person; tutoring is based on some of our data as we do track the usage.

**Item 3: First Year Experience Program**

- Embed financial wellness within the courses designated for FYE.
- Students are currently assigned a counselor within their AOI – We need to do a better job of showing HS students how this can be found, whether that be within FYE, or in the AHC orientation.
- A fully functioning FYE program with cohorts would need an office overseeing it.
  - Students “opt in” at some CCCs [FYE Staff | Ventura College, First Year Experience Program | El Camino College | Torrance, CA](#) , [Home - First Year Experience \(FYE\) - Lib-Guides at Fresno City College](#)
- It is important to make informative and prepare students for overall higher education trajectory, not just AHC.
- Important to know what high school graduates need to know when they arrive at AHC and at what time (registration, 1<sup>st</sup> year, 2<sup>nd</sup> year, last year, etc.).



- It is not meant to be overwhelming.

**Discussion:**

Erica Biely – The first-year experience program is one of the strategic priorities set by the college. We've been working on it, and we hope it will start getting some traction this Fall. It's one of the strategies that's been proposed repeatedly to help set up students to be successful in their first year. They gave us some examples here. We talked about things that we would like to see. And then first year experience program. Things like embedding the financial wellness modules that we've been doing through Title V into the first year. That connection like it says, showing high school students where they can find orientation information. We are working on this. The important part is trying to decide if we want to make the most of the first year. Experience programs have an emphasis on connecting students to their peers. And several of the models, even the ones that you see are peer mentoring models where you connect those students. We've been talking about peer mentors in terms of embedding them into the classroom to help with specific class content. But more broadly, if we were to embed services in and connect this to a first-year experience, we could also provide training to these embedded peer mentors to do other things like connect students to resources on campus (i.e., knowing how to direct students to mental health services, etc.). Just kind of a broader introduction to the college. So that's where I would like to see things go where we could do better training of our peer mentors, so that they could facilitate as connectors to the college and not just the content. But they would be able to meet with students and connect them to a counselor or to student health, or at least know about these other services to be a peer to the students that are in those classrooms.

Maria Grando - Yes, there are so many potential benefits to such a program and I'm curious as to why one doesn't exist yet. I'm assuming it might be fiscal feasibility.

Erica Biely – Yes, it's fiscal. But it's the fact that we don't have somebody in charge of such a large initiative; it really requires a director of the First-year experience program and so we've been trying to get it going just by having a task force. People are interested, but they don't want to do the work because they're already so overloaded. It really would take creating, I think, a position that could move this forward and get it implemented and running. It really would be somebody's full-time job.

Liz West - One of the things I often think about, because I teach those Introductory math classes that students take at the beginning, is that it doesn't matter what you teach people in the beginning-they don't learn it until they need to know it. I think the first-year experience is important, and it's valuable. And I think it's the college needs to examine it.

Erica Biely - It makes sense and I hear what you're saying. Also hearing it more than one time. So just because we tell them once, where something is, or how to do it, we must repeat it for them 5 or 6 times. That's why we're hoping that we could do with the first-year experience, is lay the foundation. I'm focused on the high school connection since we have Marabel in these meetings. Thinking about what high school students need when they get here. What are the things that we should know about the students that are coming from our high school district. They're not our only population of students as we have other students that are coming here. And we need to tap into our students here again in those focus groups and ask, "what do you wish you would have known when you first started? That you just found out about?"

Liz West - When we talk about first year experience, we're talking about giving them so much information and hope that they retain some of it. And I think we need to think about it like trajectory, like, what do they need in the first 10 days? What do they need in the first 10 weeks, and what do they need in the first 10 months, and then maybe what are things they need in their second year. For example, maybe they don't need to know about the transfer center. It's not that



	<p>we don't teach it, but we don't emphasize it in their first year. When we talk about what they need to know, I'd rather have it be in terms of priority.</p> <p><u>Ana Gomez de-Torres</u> – No, it's good. You are alluding to some of the things that I wanted to mention, too. It goes back to the type of students we have in the community we serve. The first year is extremely important, and it's crucial. We do always have to keep in mind that a lot of the students are first generation college students. They have no role models. They don't understand that system and don't know how to navigate, and don't know where to start.</p>
	<p><b>Item 4: Funding for Peer Mentoring Program</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Prioritize where to spend the money based on need and usage (it seems a bit wasteful to spend money on a tutor when no one goes).</li> <li>• Think about having tutors' hours limited by class unit size.</li> <li>• Need an audit of all tutors across campus, where the funding is coming from, additional program costs, and how we could better leverage those funds.</li> <li>• Can tutors be used for more than just tutoring on one subject so they could be used more fully?</li> <li>• Assign tutors to hours in the tutoring centers to allow for maximum efficiency. Tutors can help students in their classes while also being available to any student who walks in the center seeking support.</li> <li>• Consider a structure for embedded tutor workload, i.e., X course units equates to X work hours. This may vary by discipline.</li> </ul>
	<p><u>Maria Grando</u> - Thank you all so much for providing your feedback. What we plan on doing in Title V is we'll meet with our embedded task force. We will continue planning and developing institutionalization plans that hopefully will take better shape in the Fall. And we hope to be inviting you all back to another advisory meeting committee.</p>
<b>Agenda No. 4</b>	<b>Close-out for Spring 2024</b>
<b>Discussion:</b>	<p><u>Maria Grando</u> -If there is anyone on this committee that's not already involved in Title 5, and you want to continue to be involved, please reach out to me.</p>
	<p><b>Next Meeting</b> Summer/Fall 2024</p>